

## Bevan Commission Meeting

**Date of meeting:** 15<sup>th</sup> October 2015

**Time of meeting:** 08:30am – 4:00pm

**Venue for meeting:** Council Chamber, Temple of Peace

**Version:** 2

**Present:**

- Professor Sir Mansel Aylward (chair)
- Professor Anthony Newman Taylor
- Dr Helen Paterson
- Fran Targett
- Mary Cowern
- Professor Ewan MacDonald
- Sir Paul Williams
- Chris Martin
- Ruth Dineen
- Professor John Wyn Owen
- Professor Trevor Jones
- Professor Bim Bhowmick
- Dr Tony Calland
- Lieutenant General (Retired) Louis Lillywhite
- Helen Howson (Secretariat)
- Sion Charles (Secretariat)
- Dr Tom Powell (Secretariat)
- Sania Munir (Secretariat)
- Emma Carey (Secretariat)

**Apologies:**

- Nygaire Bevan
- Ann Lloyd
- Professor Andrew Morris
- Juliet Luporini
- Professor Carol Black
- Nygaire Bevan
- Sir Ian Carruthers
- Dr Clare Gerada
- Professor Andrew Morris
- Professor Phil Routledge
- Professor Michael Marmot

**In attendance:**

- David Jenkins, Stuart Cole, Ian Owen  
(11.30 am to 12.45pm)
- Michael Trickey, Adam Roberts  
(1.30pm-2.45pm)

|                 |   |  |
|-----------------|---|--|
| <p>1.</p>       | <p><b>Welcomes and apologies</b></p> <p>Professor Mansel Aylward (MA) welcomed all attending the Bevan Commission meeting.</p> <p>He reminded the Commission that Dylan Jones has moved on to join a Medical Communications company based in London. He updated on Helen Howson's (HH) new combined role as the Director of the Bevan Commission and the Bevan Academy.</p> <p>He welcomed two new members to the Bevan Commission secretariat; Tom Powell (TP), Researcher with a background in Academic Research from Cardiff University; and Sion Charles (SC) who is on secondment from 1000 lives with a background in Organisational Development supporting Helen in her new joint role.</p> <p>He also announced a newly appointed Bevan Commission member Professor Elizabeth Robb from the Florence Nightingale Foundation, and Professor Marc Clements as an additional Special Advisor.</p> <p>Apologies were noted from Nygaire Bevan, Ann Lloyd, Professor Andrew Morris, Juliet Luporini, Professor Carol Black, Nygaire Bevan, Ian Carruthers, Dr Clare Gerada, Professor Andrew Morris, Professor Phil Routledge, Professor Michael Marmot.</p>   |  |
| <p>2&amp;3.</p> | <p><b>Chairmans Update and Minutes from 15 January meeting</b></p> <p>The Bevan Commission minutes from the 14<sup>th</sup> May meeting were accepted as true account.</p> <p><b>Matters arising</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Actions from the last meeting</b></li> </ul> <p>MA provided an update on the actions from the last meeting. The majority of these had been completed or were ongoing and included:</p> <p><b>Action 0.1</b> – Secretariat to develop a short piece on the definition of health for circulation to the Commission for comment.</p> <p><b>Action 0.2</b> – Secretariat to endeavour to circulate a list of innovative practice within Wales to the Commission once this has been completed by Welsh Government.</p> <p><b>Action 0.3</b> – Secretariat to maintain contact with BIC to regarding the next steps to working with them on the sustainability issue.</p> <p><b>Action 0.4</b> – Secretariat to initiate a second phase of work that examines the long term future model or care and the associated workforce needs.</p> <p><b>Action 0.5</b> –The secretariat should establish an associated task and finish group to progress remodelling the relationship paper.</p> <p><b>Action 0.6</b> - Secretariat to advance the work on End of Life Care and established an associated task and finish group.</p> <p><b>Action 0.7</b> – Secretariat to establish links with the follow up End of Life Implementation Board that was set up by Welsh Government.</p> <p><b>Action 0.8</b>– Secretariat to further refine the administration model that would sit</p> |  |

behind the scheme and to gain agreement from the collaborating partners.

**Action 0.9** – Secretariat to advance the work on the barriers and facilitators to change over the course of the summer using the methodology presented.

- **Work Programme**

MA, HH and SC updated NHS Health Board and Trust Chairs at their meeting. In particular he updated them on the Commission's work programme and the Bevan Academy developments. They were very supportive of the work of both and very much welcomed the opportunity to discuss this and be updated. It was felt that the Commission needed to continue to update the Chairs as well as engage with individual health boards and trusts across Wales to have the opportunity to meet with the board members, sharing its thinking and work particularly around Prudent Healthcare and to undertake dialogue to help inform the future work of the Commission..

**Action Point 1.1**– Organise Commission visits to each of the Health Boards and NHS Trusts in Wales, with a consistent framework for meetings - Secretariat

- **Bevan Academy**

At the same meeting with the chairs HH and SC delivered an excellent presentation relating to the work programme, the Bevan Academy, the Bevan Innovators and the Sense maker work.

- **Prudent Healthcare**

MA has been invited to take the role as a Prudent Healthcare Champion for movement and change.

The Prudent Summit Conference was discussed. It was felt that:

- There was a need for feedback and notes from the conference.
- Strong scepticism from the third sector was noted by Commission members from the conference.
- The Minister would like to move actions towards a bottom up approach

The Minister has introduced a new work programme to help ensure delivery of prudent healthcare in practice. This will help drive and deliver results by focusing on three particular aspect of work; leadership and engagement; metrics and measurement and innovation and improvement. Two leads have been selected for each of those groups. MA will coordinate these groups and take examples of work that can be implemented.

- **Ministerial Meeting**

On the 14<sup>th</sup> December 2015 there will be a Prudent Healthcare meeting where the Minister will ask Chairs of each Health Board and Trust to spend 20 min with him to discuss Prudent Healthcare and how are they are taking it forward.

Minister requested MA and Aidian Fowler who has been appointed in Public Heath Wales, to be present at this meeting.

There was some discussion of the issues including the process of appointment of Elizabeth Robb with the Welsh Assembly Government. There was concern expressed around the independence of the Commission and of the micro management being imposed. It was agreed that the Commission should write to

the Minister to raise their concerns.

**Action Point 1.2** –MA to write letter to the Minister regarding issues around relationship with Welsh Government

**Action Point 1.3**– Secretariat to re-circulate Terms of Reference and Constitution to the Commissioners.

- **Bevan Academy**

There was a discussion around the Bevan Academy Exemplars. NHS organisations were asked to invite innovative proposals from across their organisations to support prudent healthcare, selecting 6 for submission to the Commission. At the assessment panel meeting held on October 6<sup>th</sup> members of the panel felt that the many of the examples exhibited; retrofitting, lacked of co production and innovation and in many cases lacked a clear understanding of prudent healthcare. Member also felt that there was misunderstanding of prudent health as ‘just another initiative’. This highlighted the need for further reinforcement and drive by the Minister and others to ensure that this was fully recognised as the clear policy and service direction in moving forward.

- **OECD**

MA made the commission aware that the OECD report will be coming out next week.

- **Swansea University**

Progress is being made on the hosting of the Bevan Commission and the Bevan Academy with Swansea University. The Schools of Medicine, Human and Health Sciences and Management have been keen to support the Academy as part of its ARCH proposal, and more recently the Bevan Commission. Cardiff University had also expressed an interest in hosting, but this did not materialise. MA and HH will visit the new Swansea Bay University campus to discuss this further and to also participate in a Collaborative conference. They will use this to highlight the role of the Bevan Commission, the Bevan Academy and the Bevan Innovators Programme.

It was felt that as The Bevan Commission has an excellent reputation with excellent prestige. The Commissioners made clear their support for the hosting with Swansea University and felt that this should be more formally communicated with them.

**Action Point 1.4** – MA to write to the Commission to formally confirm the transition arrangements from PHW to Swansea University.

- **International Update**

Don Berwick will be attending the Public Health Wales conference in Cardiff on the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2016. All Commissioners have also been invited. It was also hoped that some members would be able to attend a pre conference buffet lunch with him.

- **Industry links**

|           |  |  |
|-----------|--|--|
|           | <p>The Commission has signed a memorandum of understanding (MOU), with the ABPI (previously circulated to the Commission members), supporting collaborative working with the industry. Collaborative work to date includes the secondment of Lucy Scowen (GSK) and also the big data work on diabetes (J&amp;J). The ABPI is an umbrella body which brings together small and medium pharmaceutical companies. This will be formally announced at their forthcoming conference on November 10<sup>th</sup> at which Mansel and Helen will be participating. To help support this with practical actions, it is anticipated that a call would be made to industry to come forward with proposals to support prudent health principles in practice.</p>  |  |
| <p>4.</p> | <p><b>Work Programme and Bevan Innovators Update</b></p> <p>HH gave an update on the work programme and reminded the Commission that they needed to deliver on this by the end of March 2016</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Prudent Workforce</b></li> </ul> <p>The Prudent Workforce paper was finalised and was well received by the Minister. MA met with the Minister and resolved any potential conflicts between the David Jenkins Review work and future Bevan Commission's work. MA will lead a paper related to the social model within the next three months (see action point 1.7).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>End of Life</b></li> </ul> <p>The End of Life care starter paper has been developed with further evidence and the plan is to discuss this at the December Plenary meeting.</p> <p>Still awaiting publication of key reports; Annual Welsh Government End of Life Care strategy (expected end of Oct 2015) The CQC report originally expected to be published in Summer 2015 is not now expected until Spring 2016 which may be too late to incorporate into the Commission paper.</p> <p>A Task and Finish Group has been organised to gather further intelligence to also help inform this paper. This will be held in the Council Chamber, Temple of Peace 9-1pm 25<sup>th</sup> November, Ilora Finlay, representatives from the Older Peoples Commission, NHS and HEI's have been invited to attend. Any interested Bevan Commissioners are openly invited to this meeting.</p> <p><b>Action 1.5</b> – Circulate invite to Commissioners to End of Life Care task and finish group meeting.</p> <p>Chris Martin (CM) has volunteered to lead on this work with Bim Bohmick as a key member.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Barriers and Facilitators</b></li> </ul> <p>HH outlined the three components of Barriers and Facilitators to Change element of work:</p> |  |

i) Literature review.

ii) One to one feedback from local health boards, possible in conjunction with Commission visits.

iii) SenseMaker Project.

- **SenseMaker**

SC has helped develop the questions and the testing for David Snowdon's project. Local Health Boards were contacted to further test this project and to collect stories from people. They were keen to progress and work with SC to bring together the quality of evidence for the end of March.

- **Bevan Academy**

HH updated the Commission on the vision for the Bevan Academy. As mentioned above, HH and SC presented this and the Bevan Innovators at the NHS Chairs meeting, which was well received. Health Boards and Trusts were asked to nominate an operational lead for the Exemplars and were provided with detailed information including advertising materials, selection criteria and application forms. Each Organisation was asked to propose 6 submissions for review by the Bevan Commission who would select 3 from each.

A selection panel was held on the 29<sup>th</sup> September 2015 with MA, HH, SC, CM JWO, PW, SM and TP in attendance. In total 37 submissions were made by 8 of the 10 organisations. 14 submissions were approved, 10 'provisional' as they required further information before a decision could be made and 13 were rejected.

There were no nominations from Powys or Velindre. It was agreed that there will be a resubmission process for these organisation.

The final Bevan Exemplar cohort will meet with the Bevan Commissioners at the pre-evening session before the next Bevan Commission meeting in December 2015. The Exemplars have 12 month to deliver their proposed projects and will be nominated a Commissioner as a mentor.

- **A Social Model of Heath for Wales**

There was a discussion around concepts or models of health including the social model, medical model and bio-psychosocial model. MA reported that there was a wide international and UK interest in these models and the opinion of the Bevan Commission will form an important component in shaping the model for Wales. Mansel has considerable expertise and interest in this field and will lead on the initial draft of the planned Social Models paper.

|    |   |  |
|----|---|--|
|    | <p><b>Action 1.6</b> - MA to produce a first draft document on the social models for health with feedback from the Bevan Commission by the December meeting .</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Health Innovation Cymru Wales</b></li> </ul> <p>Health Innovation Cymru Wales is an important piece of related work, Chris Martin is working in conjunction with Professor Adam Cairns Chief Executive of Cardiff and Vale to support this.</p> <p><b>Action 1.7</b> – Secretariat to circulate information on Health Innovation Cymru to the Commission.</p>   |  |
| 5. | <p><b>Redrawing the relationship: co-production</b></p> <p>Ruth Dineen and HH will consolidate the discussion from the pre-evening session and respond with some feedback. HH has asked for a lead for this piece of work from the Bevan Commission to sign off for the meeting in December.</p> <p>MA would like to thank the two ladies who delivered the co production presentation.</p> <p><b>Action 1.8</b>– Fran Target has agreed to lead on the Redrawing the Relationship Paper from mid November 2015</p>   |  |
| 6. | <p><b>Green Paper consultation response</b></p> <p>There was a discussion around the Welsh Government’s Green Paper and the proposed response. MA mentioned that the green paper was a very lengthy and that the secretariat had only received two responses from the Commission to develop an official response.</p> <p>It was agreed that any submission would be best made as a general overview rather than a ‘line by line response’; Summary points raised included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Overemphasised the impact of legislation</li> <li>2. There was a failure to put emphasis on organisational culture</li> <li>3. Failure to refer to Prudent Healthcare or its principles.</li> <li>4. Lack understanding of quality management</li> </ol> <p>It was felt that the consultation gave the Commission an opportunity to make a public statement about Welsh Government and the Welsh Health Service, It wanted to use this as an opportunity to explore the models of care and to make its voice heard through more radical proposals.</p> <p><b>Action Point 1.9</b>- Produce a press release/ statement on website in conjunction with the response to the WG Green paper, ‘What are the credentials of a social</p> |  |

|                  |   |  |
|------------------|---|--|
|                  | <p>model of healthcare system in Wales?’ – Secretariat with Commissioners by the 20<sup>th</sup> November 2015.</p>   |  |
| <p><b>7.</b></p> | <p><b>Workforce: Update and Discussion with David Jenkins &amp; Stuart Cole</b></p> <p>MA introduced David Jenkins, Stuart Cole and Ian Owen from the Welsh Assembly Government to the commission. HH provided a recap of the recent Prudent Workforce Report and its findings.</p> <p>MA raised his concerns about the Commissions work set out by the Minister regarding a Prudent Workforce, which was similar to the David Jenkins work. MA mentioned that the Bevan Commission would be exploring Models of Healthcare and that this was separate but complementary to David Jenkins review.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Nuffield Trust Report –A decade of Austerity in Wales</b></li> </ul> <p>Nuffield trust report was reviewed and it was stated that the NHS would be in dire state if there were no efficiencies in 2025. This alongside the upcoming end of the 2year pay deal with the AfC unions was felt by DJ to be the driver behind the reason for his review.</p> <p>The DJ review has been asked to look at 4 specific areas:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) New models of service delivery for health and social care.</li> <li>ii) What good models already exist?</li> <li>iii) What obstacles are there in health and social care from a workforce stand point?</li> <li>iv) The long term strategic direction for pay and reward.</li> </ol> <p>There followed a wide ranging discussion with the commissioners around the ways of improving the NHS, new roles and responsibilities, how best to promote integration between health and social care.</p> <p>DJ reiterated the timescale for the review and will keep the Commission informed of its findings.</p> |  |
| <p><b>8.</b></p> | <p><b>Health Foundation – health modelling Michael Trickey /Adam Roberts Health Foundation</b></p> <p>MT gave a brief overview of the Health Foundations work to the Commissioners, with PPIW acting as Facilitators. The project is an independent study looking at long term funding issues in Wales towards 2030. This will combine an economic model alongside engagement, with policy makers and Welsh Communities. It will consider the scale of the funding issues facing the NHS in Wales in the long term.</p>   |  |



|                  |  |  |
|------------------|--|--|
|                  | <p>AR then gave a description of the 1<sup>st</sup> year project and the approaches to the proposed economic modelling before talking questions from the Commissioners. MA highlighted the proposed 'Social Model for Health' work due to be produced by the Commission and asked whether this would be able to inform the proposed modelling work and agreed to send it on when completed.</p> <p><b>Action 1.10</b> – Send 'Social Model for Health' paper when complete to inform HF modelling work</p>   |  |
| <p><b>9.</b></p> | <p><b>Early Intervention</b></p> <p>TP gave a brief overview of the Early Intervention discussion paper. The key issues highlighted were the confusion around definitions in relation to preventative services and health and social care interventions. There appeared a perception that early intervention itself was related only to the children and young adults, whereas early interventions could take place at any part of the life course to try and alter ill health and disease trajectories.</p> <p>Although the original question posed to the Commission was around prudent definitions of Early Intervention, some Commissioners felt that this was another example of a lack of clarity about the exact focus of the work asked from the Commission. It was unclear if the Commission should be setting out examples of prudent and imprudent interventions for example and the Commissioners were asked to send on any examples they thought pertinent. These included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Coproduction/early intervention in childhood obesity</li> <li>- Epigenetics, personalised medicine</li> <li>- Lambeth Council case study</li> <li>- Early intervention in sickness/injury at work</li> </ul> <p>Some discussion also addressed screening and whether this should be included or not. In light of these discussions it was felt that in the first instance the paper should be amended to include more detailed examples of early interventions with some reference to issues of screening.</p> <p><b>Action 1.11</b> – Update the early intervention paper with further examples of prudent/imprudent early interventions and reference to screening</p> |  |
| <p><b>10</b></p> | <p><b>Any other business</b></p> <p><b>None</b></p>  |  |

## Actions:

| <b>Actions carried over</b>         |  | <b>Status</b> |
|-------------------------------------|--|---------------|
| <b>A0.1</b>                         | Secretariat to develop a short piece on the definition of health for circulation to the Commission.  |               |
| <b>A0.2</b>                         | Secretariat to circulate a list of innovative practice within Wales to the Commission once this has been completed by Welsh Government.  |               |
| <b>A0.3</b>                         | Secretariat to maintain contact with BIC to regarding the next steps to working with them on the sustainability issue.   |               |
| <b>A0.4</b>                         | Secretariat to initiate a second phase of work that examines the long term future model or care and the associated workforce needs.  |               |
| <b>A0.5</b>                         | The secretariat should complete the remodelling the relationship paper with lead from Fran Targett.  |               |
| <b>A0.6</b>                         | Secretariat to advance the work on End of Life Care and establish an associated task and finish group with lead from Chris Martin.   |               |
| <b>A0.7</b>                         | Secretariat to establish links with the follow up End of Life Implementation Board that was set up by Welsh Government.  |               |
| <b>A0.8</b>                         | Secretariat to advance the work on the barriers and facilitators work building upon the feedback from HB visits  |               |
| <b>Actions from today's meeting</b> |  |               |
| <b>A1.1</b>                         | Organise Commission visits to each of the Health boards and NHS trusts in Wales, including consistent format for meetings - Secretariat  |               |
| <b>A1.2</b>                         | MA to write letter to the Minister regarding issues around relationship with Welsh government  |               |
| <b>A1.3</b>                         | Secretariat to re-circulate terms of reference and constitution to the Commissioners   |               |
| <b>A1.4</b>                         | MA to write to the Commission to formally confirm the hosting transition from PHW to Swansea University.   |               |
| <b>A1.5</b>                         | Circulate invitation to Commissioners to End of Life Care task and finish group meeting  |               |
| <b>A1.6</b>                         | MA to produce a first draft document on the social model for health with input from the Commission.  |               |
| <b>A1.7</b>                         | Chris Martin & Secretariat to circulate information on Health Innovation Cymru to the Commission.  |               |
| <b>A1.8</b>                         | Fran Targett agreed to lead on the Redrawing the Relationship Paper from mid November 2015   |               |
| <b>A1.9</b>                         | Produce a press release/ statement on for inclusion on the website and in response to the WG Green paper to reflect the comments and issues raised including the elements of a social model of healthcare in Wales.<br>Secretariat with Commissioners by the 20 <sup>th</sup> November 2015. |               |

|              |  |  |
|--------------|--|--|
| <b>A1.10</b> | Send 'Social Model for Health' paper when complete to inform HF modelling work                                   |  |
| <b>A1.11</b> | Amend the Early Intervention paper with further examples of prudent/imprudent early interventions and screening. |  |