

Bevan Commission

Bevan Commission Meeting	
Date:	Wednesday 14 th June 2017
Time:	08:30 - 15:00
Venue:	Hotel Rhianfa, Beaumaris, Anglesey
Version:	v1.1 Approved

Present:	Name:	Identification:
	Professor Sir Mansel Aylward	MA
	Nygaire Bevan	NB
	Professor Bim Bhowmick	BB
	Professor Trevor Jones	TJ
	Lt General Louis Lillywhite	LL
	Professor Ewan Macdonald	EM
	Professor John Wyn Owen	JWO
	Dr Helen Paterson	HP
	Professor Phil Routledge	PR
	Fran Targett	FT
	Secretariat:	
	Helen Howson (Director)	HH
	Dr Tom Powell	TP
	Mathilde Castagnet (Minutes)	MC

Apologies:	Name:
	Sir Anthony Newman Taylor
	Dame Carol Black
	Chris Martin
	Ann Lloyd
	Professor Michael Marmot
	Sir Ian Carruthers
	Sir Paul Williams
	Juliet Luporini
	Mary Cowern

<p>08.30 Welcome and Introductions</p>	<p>Professor Sir Mansel Aylward (MA) chaired the meeting. He welcomed Commissioners, and accepted the following apologies: CB, PW, MC, JL, CM, AL, ANT, MM, IC,</p> <p>MA thanked the Commissioners for travelling to North Wales, a first for the Commission. HP also thanked Commissioners for coming to North Wales adding that it sent a strong message that the Commission is an all-Wales organisation. It was agreed that we would aim to get to North Wales annually</p> <p>LL suggested that the papers should be numbered according to the agenda item numbering.</p> <p>ACTION: Give each agenda item number and number associated papers. Ensure all papers have page numbers and footers. Secretariat</p>
<p>Chairs Update – Recap of last evening</p>	<p>The Commissioners noted the success of the previous evening’s event, the diversity of questions and the broad representation of attendees, particularly the number of those representing Betsi Cadwaladr UHB.</p> <p>JWO mentioned that there was good mix of people from housing, health and the public, but noted that some key representatives from Bangor University were missing (Health Economics and Social Sciences). HH had contacted these but welcomed any advice from Commissioners for further suggestions in future. JWO also mentioned that Bangor University are conducting research on developing resilience in the community.</p> <p>BB suggested that the Commission should target more front line staff to embed the prudent principles with the people who use the resources and interact with patients.</p>
<p>Chairs Update – Parliamentary Review</p>	<p>Parliamentary Review</p> <p>The Commissioners discussed the role of the Bevan Commission in the Parliamentary Review. HH reminded Commissioners that a submission of evidence based upon the work of the Commission to date had been submitted to the Review from Chris Martin as Deputy Chair and Helen Howson as Director.</p> <p>All agreed that the Commission’s involvement should be objective and independent, which is consistent with the remit of the Commission.</p> <p>Innovation Summit</p> <p>MA outlined the recent Innovation Summit which he Chaired and led on behalf of WG. MA described the purpose of the Innovation Summit as a means of gathering together those prominent in innovation within health, life science and social care in Wales; with a view to sharing their contributions and agreeing an effective way of working together in the future. It was agreed that Commissioners should be involved in an advisory / coordination/ strategic lead capacity.</p>
<p>Chairs Update – Michael Sheen lecture at the Hay Festival</p>	<p>MA discussed Michael Sheen’s excellent Aneurin Bevan lecture at the recent Hay Festival and shared Michael’s wishes to work more closely with the Commission in future.</p> <p>ACTION: Secretariat to re-circulate Michael Sheen’s speech and presentation link to all Commissioners.</p>

<p>09.00</p> <p>Minutes of the last meeting and declarations of interest and Action Points</p>	<p>The minutes of the last meeting were reviewed and approved.</p> <p>All action points were recorded as complete. It was suggested that we use RAG recording on actions in future.</p> <p>HH referred to the meeting with Dr Andrew Goodall where they discussed how the successful Exemplar projects could be taken forward and implemented on an all-Wales basis. As yet, nothing has been progressed.</p> <p>HH added that the Bevan Academy had developed partnership working with the Finance Academy and Exemplars now have support from their finance colleagues, to help identify and enhance the economic impact of their work.</p> <p>ACTION: Actions from previous minutes to be updated before publication on website.</p> <p>ACTION: RAG status to be applied to actions from previous meetings.</p> <p>ACTION: Write to Dr Goodall regarding support from the Delivery Support Unit to implement the successful exemplar projects</p>
<p>09.30</p> <p>Appointment of New Members</p>	<p>MA reviewed the names of the Commissioners who recently left the Commission: Tony Calland; Liz Robbe; Ruth Duneen; Andrew Morris.</p> <p>MA confirmed that all the leavers had valid reasons for their departure.</p> <p>MA also advised that he will contact Clare Gerada and Sir Ian Curruthers regarding their future membership in the Commission. It was noted that due to their busy schedules and commitments it was difficult for them to attend the meetings and fulfil the commitments of the Commission.</p> <p>MA reminded Commissioners of the two vehicles for the appointment of new members namely; nomination and open invitation.</p> <p>The nominations received, following an invitation to Commissioners to submit to MA included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Baroness Ilora Finlay • Professor Hywel Thomas • Dame Sue Bailey <p>Commissioners have agreed to review the biographies of the nominations and feedback any comments to Mansel as soon as possible.</p> <p>HH explained that historically, a profile of expertise needs was established to ensure good coverage within the Commission. The Commission agreed that the gaps now available should be based upon a similar needs-analysis based on the expertise gaps in the current membership.</p> <p>A discussion took place regarding the need to recruit replacement Commissioners and some suggestions were considered. A number of suggestions were made regarding the need to complement existing expertise. For example: media, anthropology and other key statespeople.</p> <p>Commissioners agreed that both individual nominations and external invitations will be used to recruit new members for the Commission.</p>

	<p>ACTION: Send to Commissioners the correspondence from MA to those retiring Commissioners. Secretariat</p> <p>ACTION: Commissioners to feed back to MA on suggested nominations. Commissioners</p> <p>ACTION: MA to contact Clare Gerada and Ian Carruthers to discuss their membership of Commission.</p> <p>ACTION: Commissioners to give wider consideration to potential candidates.</p>
<p>09.45</p> <p>Bevan Commission work update</p>	<p>HH took the Commissioners through the quarterly report for Welsh Government, which summarises the Commission’s recent activities between April – June including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two health board executive meetings • Two innovation events • The third cohort of Bevan Exemplars developed and currently advertised • Evaluation report from Prof Nick Rich to be transcribed into a more scientific paper • The Great Bevan Challenge <p>TP informed Commissioners that ISBN numbers have been purchased so that published papers can become accessible for research.</p> <p>Commissioners received the Exemplar Evaluation report and were asked to review this. JWO noted that the report was a good technical evaluation but lacked philosophical points. HH also added that the leadership journey of the Exemplars is not covered in this evaluation. Commissioners were asked to identify opportunities to disseminate the evaluation report through their networks.</p> <p>Commissioners were delighted by the amount of work that had been done by the team over the last three months and the impact created, requesting that their thanks were formally recorded to all the team.</p> <p>ACTION: Commissioners were asked to identify opportunities to disseminate the evaluation report through their networks.</p>
<p>10.00</p> <p>Great Bevan Challenge</p>	<p>TJ introduced the Great Bevan Challenge (GBC) to the Commissioners. The aim of this is to bring together agencies involved in data to identify a common challenge that they may better use their collective expertise.</p> <p>The first meeting took place on the 1st June involving representatives from Finance, NWIS, SAIL and ABCi. The group picked COPD as a pathfinder topic to test out the approach.</p> <p>TJ mentioned the previous publication from the Commission entitled ‘<i>Data and Information in NHS Wales: the good, the bad and the ugly</i>’.</p> <p>The Secretariat recently conducted a review of the Commission’s recommendations, which shows that very little progress has been made in addressing the issues. This information will be checked for accuracy and formally submitted at the next meeting for consideration.</p>

	<p>LL advised the group of the sensitivity of bringing data together from various organisations and that the project will need a level of risk analysis and mitigation.</p> <p>ACTION: Contact Chris Subbe regards the Finnish study Review of patient held records and disseminate to commissioners.</p> <p>ACTION: present the final review on the Good, Bad and the Ugly.</p>
<p>10.15</p> <p><i>Achieving Profound and Sustainable Improvement in Quality in NHS Wales</i></p>	<p>MA provided an overview of the final draft of the Quality paper. The paper was approved to submit to Vaughan Gething (VG), Cabinet Secretary for Health, Well-being and Sport and Andrew Goodall, Director General - Health and Social Services for their comments 5 days prior to the wider and more formal dissemination.</p> <p>MA will request a meeting with VG to discuss how Welsh Government (WG) will take the recommendations forward.</p> <p>It was also suggested that a request be made to WG for regular accounts (every six months) on progress. To enable a discussion and debate around quality, the Commission suggested the organisation of a future Health Quality Summit. MA asked EMC to present to the Directors of Workforce at the event.</p> <p>ACTION: Attach ISBN and produce a final version of the Quality Paper.</p> <p>ACTION: MA to write to VG/AG regarding the Quality Paper. (Commissioners agreed that VG/AG would have 5 working days to read and review papers before publication).</p> <p>ACTION: MA to meet with VG to discuss implications of the Quality Paper.</p> <p>ACTION: Set up a Health Quality Summit to maintain momentum and discussion on the paper and provide opportunity for NHS Wales & WG to provide feedback on the progress of its implementation. Secretariat</p> <p>ACTION: EMC to participate in a future Master Class session and present to NHS Wales WODs.</p>
<p>10.45</p> <p>Future Prudent Model of Health paper and next steps</p>	<p>The Prudent Model paper was shared with Commissioners for review. The Board thanked HH for the hard work she dedicated to writing the paper. JWO commented that this was one of the most challenging and thought provoking papers that the Commission had produced to date.</p> <p>HH presented the key points from the paper to Commissioners and highlighted that this was the start of a process which would need to engage others to arrive at a final version.</p> <p>Key feedback received included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rehabilitation and social security benefits references are omitted • Include reference to hospitals in the model • Review the paper to ensure all communities are included • Check that the paper provides solutions to some of the difficult decisions to be made regarding the current issues with the NHS in Wales • Reconsider the title not as a social model but a care services/cooperative model

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reference to the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act • How the model relates to integration, structure, governance and measurement of outcomes <p>Commissioners raised the need to consider how the impact of the paper will be measured once it is published. Reference was made to the EQ5D European Quality of Life Measures as a potential measure.</p> <p>Commissioners were asked to send feedback to Helen within 10 working days and once completed, a copy of the paper will be sent to the Minister and to the Parliamentary Review. A discussion took place around the need to disseminate the paper widely once it is ready through social media and to consult stakeholders.</p> <p>ACTION: Circulate model paper and ask for comments from Commissioners in the next 10 days.</p> <p>ACTION: Distribute the draft Model Paper for consultation.</p> <p>ACTION: Engage the wider public in its ongoing development during the next 6 months</p>
<p>12.00 Update on the Bevan Advocates</p>	<p>MA informed the Commissioners that the Bevan Advocates were to join them for lunch. A copy of their biographies was circulated and an update of their work to date provided.</p>
<p>13.15 Economic and Health aspects of the City Deals – sharing experiences across Wales</p>	<p>This item stems from the issues that JWO raised at the last meeting around Global Health. Two papers to support this have been previously circulated.</p> <p>JWO presented the latest developments on the City Deal and ARCH projects. HP presented on the North Wales Economic Ambition Board. HP expressed the challenge of North Wales between the North East and North West. HP also informed that engaging with the healthcare sector in the talks is the biggest challenge. LL suggested that the Commission should help with this challenge in North Wales.</p> <p>MA suggested the mapping of private healthcare to identify the gaps in availability.</p> <p>JWO explained that the City Deal model is not suitable for more rural areas in Wales and there is a need for an economic plan for rural Wales. It was agreed that these issues need to be communicated widely. MA asked JWO to write a short paper to be circulated.</p> <p>ACTION: Produce a communique for wider dissemination across NW referring to the papers and the discussion held.</p>
<p>13. 45 Publications Strategy & Communications Update (Prudent Focus, Expert Opinion, Updated Commission papers - Prudent Data paper) Tom Powell/ Mathilde Castagnet,</p>	<p>TP presented the publication plan. The plan includes themes and targets thought pieces, journal articles, grey literature pieces and local publications.</p> <p>TP explained that there is not yet an approved publication strategy for the processing of publishing a Bevan Commission paper. It was agreed that a standardised approach is required and the Commissioners were supportive of this proposed format.</p>

	<p>PR offered to help lead on the pharmacy related topics of the next Commission's publication.</p> <p>HH informed the Commission that the recently advertised post of Communications Manager failed to recruit a suitable candidate. The post has now been re-graded and is awaiting re-advertising. HH is currently looking for interim communications resource to support the Annual Conference publicity and communications.</p> <p>The DNA Focus paper was approved as a vehicle to raise questions or issues for discussion subject to clarification of the Welsh data.</p> <p>LL suggested that Commissioners should all look to develop an Expert Opinion piece every year. LL agreed to finalise the first paper, addressing wider issues around DNA.</p> <p>TP explained that the Prudent Focus paper could not be disseminated at present due to issues with finding Welsh costing data. TP updated Commissioners on the work undertaken to find the Welsh costs. The team was led to the Collaborative but no costing information has yet been shared. The Commission expressed disappointment at the lack of access/transparency from the finance services. MA suggested contact be made with Bob Hudson (Director of the Collaborative) to find out more.</p> <p>The Data and Information paper <i>The Good bad and the Ugly</i> was reviewed. The update to the data paper published in 2013 found very little progress had been made against the actions identified. The Commission asked the Secretariat to investigate the remit of the Informatics Task and Finish Group and validate the information before signing this off.</p> <p>ACTION: Recirculate the publication strategy listing possible future papers with the publication grid to Commissioners. Secretariat</p> <p>ACTION: Contact Bob Hudson regarding Welsh costing data.</p> <p>ACTION: Establish the current position of the All Wales Taskforce on informatics and update the data paper accordingly.</p>
<p>14.15</p> <p>Future Business Model and Governance arrangements for the Bevan Commission</p> <p>Mansel Aylward /Helen Howson</p>	<p>MA described the role and membership of each of the new groups involved in the governance of the Commission:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Operational Group: will monitor the day-to-day operational matters. Members included MA, CM, HH, SP, SC • Governance Group: will address formal governance, financial and operational aspects Members include MA, Chris Martin, Trevor Jones, Helen Howson, Marc Clement Fran Targett and Leighton Phillips. <p>HH informed Commissioners that work is underway to finalise the strategic and operational plans.</p> <p>Commissioners praised the work carried out by the student group and wanted this to be included for consideration on the potential business model.</p> <p>MA presented the developments regarding establishing the Commission as a potential Institute within the University. It would be independent,</p>

	<p>impartial and have separate governance from Swansea University. MA informed the Commissioners that he does not require any commitment as yet but this option will have to be considered further. MA will gain further information on this to inform future discussions.</p> <p>ACTION: MA will gain further information on establishing the Commission as a potential Institute within the University to inform future discussions on the business model.</p>
<p>14.45 Future Conference / Meetings</p> <p>AOB</p>	<p>MA gave an update on the Annual Bevan Commission conference in September and invited all Commissioners to attend and to be actively involved in the programme/micro-lab sessions. It was agreed that all Commissioners would promote the conference through their networks and support on the day presenting /chairing sessions etc.</p> <p>MA informed Commissioners of the next meetings:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 13th September Bevan Commission (Foundation) Board meeting • 14th September Bevan Commission Annual Conference, Great Hall, Swansea • 15th September Plenary Meeting, Swansea University, Bay Campus • 8th December Meeting at the Mercure Hotel, Cardiff <p>ACTION: Recirculate future meetings schedule.</p> <p>ACTION: Invite AG and CMO to the next plenary meeting.</p> <p>ACTION: Ensure list of meeting dates is up to date on website. Secretariat.</p> <p>ACTION: Commissioners reconsidered the wording of the December 2016 meeting minutes with reference to Epigenetics from Layla Jader.</p> <p>It was agreed that the following addendum be made to the minutes of the December 2015 plenary meeting to replace the last sentence of item 10:</p> <p><i>Revision to item 10: "Some Commissions commented that whilst there is no doubt that epigenetics can have a profound effect of child health, the basic mechanisms involved are still not fully understood but in view of the importance of the subject, there is a need to continue to generate more data that can be used predictively to determine appropriate interventions to improve child and adult health"</i></p> <p>ACTION: revise the minutes of the December 2015 plenary meeting minutes as agreed.</p>
<p>15.00 Meeting close</p>	

New Actions from June Meeting:						
No	Date Created	Action	Owner	Proposed Completion Date	Comment	RAG Status: Red – Not Started Amber – In Progress Green - Complete
JUN1	June 2017	Give agenda item number & associated papers. All papers page numbered	Secretariat			G
JUN2	June 2017	Re-circulate Michael Sheen's Aneurin Bevan lecture and link to Commissioners	Secretariat			G
JUN3	June 2017	Actions from previous minutes to be updated before publication on website	Secretariat			G
JUN4	June 2017	RAG status to be applied to actions from previous meetings	Secretariat			G
JUN5	June 2017	Write to Dr Andrew Goodall regarding support from the Delivery Support Unit to implement the successful exemplar projects	MA			G
JUN6	June 2017	Circulate the correspondence from MA to retiring Commissioners	Secretariat			G
JUN7	June 2017	Commissioners to feed back to MA on suggested nominations to the Commission	Commissioners			G
JUN8	June 2017	Contact Clare Gerada and Ian Carruthers to discuss ongoing membership of Commission	MA			G
JUN9	June 2017	Give wider consideration to potential Commission candidates	Commissioners			G

No	Date Created	Action	Owner	Proposed Completion Date	Comment	RAG Status:
						Red – Not Started Amber – In Progress Green - Complete
JUN10	June 2017	Identify opportunities to disseminate the evaluation report through networks	Commissioners		In progress, ongoing	A
JUN11	June 2017	Contact Chris Subbe regarding the Finnish study review of patient held records and circulate to Commissioners	TP			G
JUN12	June 2017	Attach ISBN and produce a final version of Quality Paper	TP			G
JUN13	June 2017	MA to write and meet with VG regarding the Quality Paper	MA			G
JUN14	June 2017	Set up a Quality Health Summit	Secretariat	Date TBC	In progress	A
JUN15	June 2017	To participate in a future Master Class session and present to NHS Wales WODs	EMC			A
JUN16	June 2017	Circulate model paper and ask for comments from Commissioners	Secretariat			G
JUN17	June 2017	Distribute the draft Model Paper for consultation	HH			G
JUN18	June 2017	Engage the wider public in ongoing development of the Prudent Model paper	Secretariat		Not started	R
JUN19	June 2017	Produce a communique for wider dissemination across NW referring to the papers and the discussions held	JWO	Date TBC	In progress	A
JUN20	June 2017	Recirculate the publication strategy listing possible future	Secretariat	September	In progress	A

		papers with the publication grid				
No	Date Created	Action	Owner	Proposed Completion Date	Comment	RAG Status: Red – Not Started Amber – In Progress Green - Complete
JUN21	June 2017	Contact Bob Hudson regarding Welsh costing data	HH			G
JUN22	June 2017	Establish the current position of the All Wales Taskforce on informatics and update the data paper accordingly	MC			A
JUN23	June 2017	Gain further information on the Commission as an Institute in the University to inform future discussions on the business model	MA, HH		In progress	A
JUN24	June 2017	Recirculate future plenary meeting dates	Secretariat			G
JUN25	June 2017	Invite AG and CMO to future plenary meetings	HH			G
JUN26	June 2017	Ensure list of meetings is up to date on website	Secretariat			G
JUN27	June 2017	Provide an amended comment and include as an addendum to the December 2015 plenary meeting minutes: reference epigenetics presentation	TJ			G

Previous Meeting's Outstanding Actions						
No	Date Created	Action	Who By	Proposed Completion Date	Comments	Status
MA R1	Mar 17	Continue to work with business, academia and other partners to identify opportunities to strengthen research and evaluation of the already excellent progress made, including the health strand of the City Deal programme	Secretariat		Ongoing	Ongoing
MA R3	Mar 17	A business plan to be developed with a clear strategy for long term financial security	Secretariat		Ongoing developments and discussions with SU re and Institution	
MA R10	Mar 17	Gain feedback on content, finalise and publish the Prudent Focus paper via communications and media outlets, monitoring its impact in creating wider dialogue and action	Secretariat		Final text being checked for accuracy	
MA R12	Mar 17	Circulation of the Prudent Model of Health to the PR once published	Secretariat		Ongoing	
MA R13	Mar 17	Two issues to discuss with health boards were: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. the application of prudence 2. the future models of prudent healthcare 	Commissioners		Agreed - Visits Ongoing	
MA R14	Mar 17	At least an hour and a half slot for meetings	Secretariat		Agreed – but some	

		with health boards to ensure sufficient time for a quality, robust debate on prudent healthcare and the future model for health			difficulty in arranging with the Boards	
--	--	---	--	--	---	--