

Bevan Commission

Bevan Commission Plenary Meeting	
Date:	8 th December 2017
Time:	08:30 – 15:00
Venue:	Mercure Hotel, Cardiff
Version:	0.7

Present:	Name:	Identification:
Chair:	Professor Sir Mansel Aylward	MA
Commissioners:	Mary Cowern	MC
	Professor Trevor Jones	TJ
	Lt General Louis Lillywhite	LL
	Dame Sue Bailey	EM
	Chris Martin	CM
	Professor Kamila Hawthorne	JWO
	Nygaire Bevan	NB
	Fran Targett	FT
	Professor Hywel Thomas	HT
	Sir Paul Williams	PW
	Professor Philip Routledge	PR
	Baroness Ilora Finlay	IF
	Sir Paul Williams	PW
Secretariat:		
	Helen Howson (Director)	HH
	Elizabeth Jones (Minutes)	

Apologies:	Name:
	Professor Bim Bhowmick
	Dame Carol Black
	Sir Ian Carruthers
	Ann Lloyd
	Juliet Luporini
	Professor Michael Marmot
	Professor John Wyn Owen
	Professor Ewan Macdonald
	Professor Anthony Newman Taylor

Welcome and Introductions 08:30	<p>Professor Sir Mansel Aylward (MA) chaired the meeting and welcomed Prof Kamila Hawthorne, (KH) Baroness Ilora Finlay, (IF) and Dame Sue Bailey (SB) as new Commissioners. MA accepted the apologies as named in the table above. MA thanked the Commissioners for travelling to attend yesterday's meeting with the third sector.</p>
Chair's Update 08:45	<p>MA invited Fran Targett (FT) to provide an update on the previous evening's meeting with the third sector and the agreed actions for those Commissioners who were unable to attend.</p> <p>On behalf of the Commission, FT thanked Lynne Hughes, Country Director MS Cymru for attending and making such a valuable contribution to the debate and her representation for the third sector. Whilst attendance was poor this seemed to be common across a number of fronts.</p> <p>Despite this the debate was very helpful particularly in identifying the wide range of roles that the Commissioners play within the 3rd sector. The Board agreed that a small task and finish group will be set up to take this work forward. FT offered to lead the group (with MC supporting), to better engage with the third sector and agree key actions.</p> <p>ACTION: FT to establish T&F group with the sector.</p>
Chair's Update MA	<p>Parliamentary Review</p> <p>MA provided an update on the progress of the parliamentary review (PR) which is due to be published in the 16th of January.</p> <p>The interim report recommended better engagement with the public. The Commission is already planning a wider conversation with the public in Spring (Later on the meeting agenda). The Commission's planned work will be able to support the outcomes of the PR in this respect.</p> <p>It was agreed that the Commission will prepare a response 2 weeks following the PR announcement, and will outline its response and include the work of the Commission and how it may be able to support the findings.</p> <p>Kamila Hawthorne (KH), raised the importance of health education and the need for future generations of our young people to engage with the third sector, to learn more about their work and how to get involved.</p> <p>It was agreed to await the announcement of the PR before the Commission's launch of the next paper: A New way of Planning: Towards a prudent Model of care a week following the PR report.</p> <p>MA and Chris Martin (CM) discussed their new roles in the Life Sciences Hub. Cari-Ann Quinn (Life Science Hub) could be invited to the next plenary meeting to talk about how the Commission can get involved with the Hub and identify any joint working opportunities. MA shared his news that he is taking extended leave for his world tour from January 7th to March 2018.</p> <p>ACTION: Launch Second social model paper 1 week following publication of PR Report</p> <p>ACTION: Prepare a response to the PR announcement</p>
Minutes and Outstanding Actions	<p>Responses to previous minutes.</p> <p>Page 2 chairs update – matters arising: Health Innovation Partnership Wales: HH gave an update on the partnership, following the meeting in June. WG are bringing together a focus on innovation, with good examples linked with the Life Science Hub from academia, health, NHS. The Bevan Commission will have a key role to play in this</p>

	<p>and a draft MOU has been prepared. The concluding report will be submitted to the Cabinet Secretary.</p> <p>Page 3 of September’s minutes, item 1 – MA has now met with Leanne Wood AM, where it was agreed that the Commission will present to the Assembly in the New Year. The Commission has been invited to present a 5 minute agenda slot followed by 15 minute questions and answers.</p> <p>SEP3: LL – Highlighted an excellent group of Bevan Exemplars and Advocates. We need to identify which ones are ‘game changers’. HH explained that she had met with Andrew Goodhall and member of the WG Efficiency board to follow this up. We are preparing the Innovators as a business case package. LL suggest that we highlight the top 3 projects that could make a difference.</p> <p>KH: We need to think outside the box, raising awareness to increase pressure on WG from all angles to get other bodies to support us in this.</p> <p>FT: There is lots of fantastic work but we need to consider how we embed as good practice across Wales?</p> <p>IF: Are there adequate links to copyright via the university and create a source of income for these innovative projects?</p> <p>P9: re Action for nominations of new Commissioners – to be reviewed.</p> <p>Re Action for masterclass session – remove as it was completed as part of quality debate.</p> <p>JUN 23 ongoing</p> <p>JUN 25 Invited CMO to previous meetings, he was unable to attend to date.</p> <p>JUN21 Despite numerous enquiries the situation is still unclear.</p> <p>Declaration of interest: CM and TJ both hold formal roles with the SoM.</p> <p>ACTION: To send out a Declaration of Conflict of Interest form out to all Commissioners.</p>
<p>Governance, Operations & Future Options MA & CM</p>	<p>CM updated the Board on the progress of the Foundation Board and its work on the changing governance of the Commission. Legal advice and quotations have been sought from three legal firms.</p> <p>The quotations support package offered by three companies were compared. It was agreed that the Foundation Board should agree to work with their preferred supplier. Work will progress with the preferred supplier, investigating alternative governance models, including a establishing a company limited by guarantee.</p> <p>ACTIONS: Follow up agreement with preferred legal supplier.</p>
<p>Quarterly Work Update</p>	<p>HH talked through the tabled report and apologised for the lateness.</p> <p>This report is an update on the Commission’s work over the last six months since July 2017. HH invited further questions from Commissioners. Initial feedback was received from LL, commenting that the report is an opportunity to reflect on the improved communications strategy and the vastly improved social media presence and interaction as a result.</p> <p>MA thanked HH for her work efforts following her recent knee surgery and thanked the team for their support during this difficult period.</p>
<p>Quality Debate</p>	<p>HH provided an overview of the Quality Debate including the speakers and audience. Ewan Macdonald was unable to phone in to offer his feedback on the debate.</p>

	<p>HH invited IF and PW to update the Board on the Quality Debate. Whilst turnout was disappointing, the quality of debate and interaction with the audience was very encouraging.</p> <p>Highlights of the debate were shared by IF to Commissioners including;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The tension between process and outcomes. • How we measure outcomes and patients’ experience. • Dr Bacon’s presentation prompted much valued discussion during the debate including the need to evaluate patients’ experiences at point of delivery. • Links to the reduction in patient evaluations and the links to the reduced funding. • Tensions around legislation. <p>HH reminded that the British Standards Institute had previously agreed to support wider discussion and debate regarding the potential external quality validation system. The BSI have offered to hold a series of workshops over the next six months to form a decision and final document with the Commission’s formal recommendations. Commissioners agreed that this should be progressed.</p> <p>IF: noted the risk that an external quality validation standard might be too complicated. Since the meeting, Bristol Royal Infirmary has completely changed the way their staff worked, following a problem with standards in their Accident & Emergency Unit. Staff in all departments and wards have overcome the departmentalised silo working culture by sharing ownership of their problems in A&E. it was suggested the project could be invited to share their experience at a future meeting.</p> <p>LL added further examples during his time in Afghanistan. MA: invited LL to share this formally with the Commission and to contribute as a case study to the paper; MA extended this to the remaining Commissioners inviting them to share their experiences.</p> <p>IF discussed this with Mark Drakeford. He was keen to use the example from Bridgend Council who experienced a problem with their delivery of care of the elderly.</p> <p>ACTION: Follow up with BSI following Quality debate</p> <p>ACTION: Collect case studies identified by Commissioners</p>
<p>Communications Strategy</p>	<p>HH thanked Emma Bryant for her work over the last six months. Emma is no longer able to support the Commission. A Communications Officer post will be advertised. The Board agreed that the work Emma has done to date has been very successful and helped promote the Commission as a brand with stakeholders.</p> <p>HH talked through the Communications Strategy document and how we will use it as a tool moving forward. FT thought the document was very useful and will give the incoming Communications Officer a good start and will help with the future programme of work.</p> <p>FT questioned the recruitment timeline and the use of some short term resource in the interim. MA will raise this with SoM Dean Marc Clement, and will request a resource from Swansea University in the interim period until we recruit a more permanent resource.</p> <p>LL: provided specific feedback on the style of social media communication from the Bevan Commission Twitter account. He proposed the use of more stakeholder-specific language and customise hashtags for each stakeholder group (clinicians and general public).</p>

	<p>CM: noted that our events and promotional material needs to link in with the current business plan and should reflect the tapered WG funding. It was agreed that we should develop a brand package to market commercially and would use the Communications Strategy to contribute to this package/business case.</p> <p>LL representing the Board, thanked Emma Bryant formally for all her assistance, which has had a huge impact on the work of the Commission.</p> <p>ACTION: Advertise Comms Officer Post.</p>
<p>Big Conversation with the Public</p>	<p>HH explained the background and rationale in promoting a wider conversation with the public around the social and prudent model of health. There may be opportunities to link with the recommendations of the Parliamentary Review. The feedback will help inform the final document in the series on Exploiting Welsh Legacy: Delivering the future model for Wales. We have explored opportunities to engage with the third sector, Participation Cymru and the Kings Fund. Good ground work has already been undertaken by the Kings Fund in understanding public views of the NHS and discussion have taken to explore this further.</p> <p>Tom Powell (TP) and Mathilde Castagnet (MCas) outlined their discussions with the Kings Fund and proposed discussions with IPSOS-Mori to replicate (with additional questions as necessary) in Wales. It was noted that there will be a cost charged by IPSOS-MORI for their work on this project (approximately £6,000). The Board felt that that further discussions should take place to gain the best value for money.</p> <p>A discussion followed, resulting in the following points:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Commissioners will provide their three key questions specifically to Wales that they would like to put to the public. 2. The language used in the survey should concentrate not on the premise of illness and being unwell but more positive such as “what can we do to keep you well”. Opportunity to have a more positive conversation with the public and it should shift the balance to place-based wellness. 3. Develop a reference group of lay-public over time to measure improvement 4. Engage with other organisations who have a national voice including our own Advocates. 5. Be careful with the terminology and language choices used in survey. 6. Good practice to use a cross-section of the public. <p>ACTION: Progress plans for wider conversation with the public</p>
<p>Data and Information Good Bad and Ugly</p>	<p>HH reminder commissioners of the background to this paper. This will be discussed with the Cab Sec at a meeting next week. In the interim ongoing discussions with key stakeholder in the NHS and welsh government the paper has been updated.</p> <p>MCas highlighted 3 key updates to the paper</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reference to the task and finish group on page 5 section 2. • Reference to the health and care strategy and • Reference to the role of NHS informatics management board (within NWIS). • Key recommendations have now reflected these additional points and the views of the commissioners. <p>HH talked through the report’s recommendations, the Board agreed a number of amendments which will be included in the final version of the document</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>(IF: Wording on page 8 – word missing. (3 dimensional)</i>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Combining data to provide outcome based data (simplify this)</i> • <i>Reference last night – prudent decisions rather than sounding like rationing</i> • <i>Motivate bullet – doesn't read right – decrease risk aversion</i> • <i>Remove protectionism</i> • <i>Need to empathise the positive support of the commission</i> • <i>Put exec summary at front of paper with key issues and look forward to working with the Minister to resolve this.)</i> <p>ACTION: Makes changes and produce final draft for meeting with Cab Sec</p>
<p>Healthcare Indicators</p>	<p>HH reminder commissioners of the background to this paper which evolved from the need to determine prudent indicators. As a result of the complex environment around outcomes and indicators a mapping exercise was undertaken. HH invited MC to provide further information of the finding to date.</p> <p>The presentation prompted feedback from Commissioners around the potential to use more positive language such as “regaining health” or “getting people better”. A lengthy discussion was held around outcomes measures and indicators.</p> <p>It was agreed that the Commission will produce an initial short commentary paper. In conclusion, the commissioners felt that on the basis of the information presented that the system does not appear fit for purpose and reflected a medical model. It does not include wellbeing and the term public health is not prominent enough.</p> <p>ACTION: Updated Indicators paper taking into account comments.</p>
<p>Commission Conference</p>	<p>HH talked through the outline programme of next year’s international conference and our aspirations for the conference. HH explained the good package offered by our preferred venue at the Celtic Manor resort and the support of Sir Terry Mathews. HH invited comments from the board regarding the proposed dates, venue and programme. After a discussion, the following actions/decisions were agreed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The conference should be a two day event not three. • The agenda should be more radical e.g. challenge the existing GP model, highlighting what is wrong with the system as it stands. • The conference should address the principle of free at the point of delivery and if the Bevan Principles work in this modern age. • Possibly split the agenda for each day to attract difference stakeholder groups. • Children and young people to be offered the chance to get involved in the debate: school orchestras, sports clubs etc., Child mental health and child education programme – bring this together and discuss with Children’s Commission. • Health and wellbeing journalists to participate in the debate as well as those who report on the event. • The agenda should look at how patients contribute to change and should reflect our engagement with patients. • Make sure we use our Advocates and the NFWI and put them on the stage. • Make sure the Public Conversation survey results are fed into the event including a debate. • Check for clashes with other NHS events? • Possibly involvement of school orchestras.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Key workshops short (breakout sessions Allow speakers 5 slides 5 minutes, 5 bullets etc.). • Reflect on and learn from this year’s conference. • Clarify financial costs and anticipated potential sponsorship income. <p>ACTION: Continue Conference Plan</p>
Summer school	<p>HH talked through the recent opportunity to include a Summer School in 2018 linked to the conference. Funding opportunities to support this are being explored and WG have indicated their financial support. HH to provide further details of funding availability and costs etc.</p> <p>Further information on the costs and expected outcomes of this project was requested by Commissioners as they were concerned about over commitment of resources</p> <p>ACTION: Continue to explore summer school.</p>
Bevan Book	<p>HH briefed commissioners on the draft circulated framework of content and titles for the book. HH invited feedback from Commissioners regarding proposed sections to be authored by each of the Commissioners. Commissioners supported the proposal and their involvement and further guidance on format consistency and presentation etc.</p> <p>ACTION: Progress with development of Commission Anniversary Book.</p>
Prudent Workforce Paper	<p>HH briefed the Commissioners on the draft workforce paper. Questions were raised by Commissioners;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Who is the anticipated audience? • There are gaps in practices, health care providers, clinician groups need to be included • The need for good workforce data on workforce should be in our recommendations. • References to other research are included when the paper is published. <p>ACTION: Progress draft of workforce paper.</p>
Bevan Ambassadors	<p>Nygaire Bevan (NB) provided an update on the proposed Bevan Ambassadors. A discussion took place on how we can define and attract Ambassadors to support the work of the Commission. A list of potential Ambassadors was discussed from various areas of expertise, together with a patron. It was agreed that a role profile will be developed further. MA agreed to contact possible individuals on behalf of the Commission and HH and NB to write this up formally. MA will also contact Prince of Wales’ secretary.</p> <p>ACTION: NB to progress and present on the Bevan Ambassadors proposal at next meeting</p>
Future Conference/Meetings	<p>The following dates were proposed for 2018 Plenary Meetings: (Locations to be discussed)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Wednesday 28th February in Swansea/Cardiff depending on Cab Sec attendance • Tuesday 1st May in North Wales • Wed 4 July PM – post conference review plenary <p>Annual Conference: Celtic Manor Resort, Coldra 2 day dates TBC: Mon 2nd July, Tue 3rd July, Wed 4th July</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tue 2nd October in West Wales. • Wed 12th December.
AoB	<p>In line with the roll-out in Wales of the WHO patient safety challenge “Medication without Harm” and the AWMSG strategy for 2018-2023 PR spoke regarding a proposed All Wales Therapeutics and Toxicology Centre to partner the Bevan Commission to support the Bevan Commission’s Prudent Pharmacy Initiative.</p> <p>AWTTC would aim to provide expertise, mentorship and when feasible, relevant data on prescribing and medication safety reports in Wales to support collaborative projects in Prudent Pharmacy.</p> <p>This proposal was warmly supported by Commissioners.</p> <p>ACTION: Circulate AWMSG strategy associated paper to Commissioners</p>
Meeting Close	15:00

New Actions from December 2017 Meeting:						
No	Date Created	Action	Owner	Proposed Completion Date	Comment	RAG Status: Red – Not Started Amber – In Progress Green - Complete
DEC 1	Dec 17	Establish T&F group with the sector.	FT		tbc	A
DEC2	Dec 17	Launch Second social model paper 1 week following publication of PR Report	Secretariat		Completed	G
DEC3	Dec 17	Prepare a response to the PR announcement	HH		Completed	G
DEC4	Dec 17	To send out a Declaration of Conflict of Interest form out to all Commissioners	Secretariat		To Repeat	A
DEC5	Dec 17	Follow up agreement with preferred legal supplier.	HH/CM		Ongoing	G
DEC6	Dec 17	Follow up with BSI following Quality debate	Secretariat		Ongoing	A
DEC7	Dec 17	Collect case studies identified by Commissioners	Secretariat		Completed	G
DEC8	Dec 17	Advertise Comms Officer Post.	Secretariat		Completed	G
DEC9	Dec 17	Progress plans for wider conversation with the public	TP/MCas		Completed	G
DEC10	Dec 17	Makes changes and produce final draft for meeting with Cab Sec	TP/MCas		Completed	G
DEC11	Dec 17	Updated Indicators paper taking into account comments.	TP/MCas		Completed	G
DEC12	Dec 17	Continue Conference Plan	Secretariat		Ongoing	G
DEC13	Dec 17	Continue to explore summer school.	HH/LL		Ongoing	A
DEC14	Dec 17	Progress with development of	Secretariat		Agenda Item Feb 2018.	G

		Commission Anniversary Book.				
DEC15	Dec 17	Progress draft of workforce paper	HH/TP		Agenda Item Feb 2018.	G
DEC16	Dec 17	NB to progress and present on the Bevan Ambassadors proposal at next meeting	NB		Agenda Item Feb 2018.	G
Dec17	Dec 17	Circulate AWMSG strategy associated paper to Commissioners	Secretariat		Completed	G

Outstanding actions:						
No	Date Created	Action	Owner	Proposed Completion Date	Comment	RAG Status: Red – Not Started Amber – In Progress Green - Complete
JUN18	June 2017	Engage the wider public in ongoing development of the Prudent Model paper	Secretariat		Agenda Item Feb 2018.	G
MAR3	Mar 17	A business plan to be developed with a clear strategy for long term financial security	Secretariat		Ongoing developments regarding the future BC configuration	Ongoing